



EDINBURGH CURLING CLUB LTD

13a Riversdale Crescent
EDINBURGH, EH12 5XN

Tel: 0131 337 4242 Fax: 0131 346 4654
e-mail: info@murrayfieldcurling.co.uk
www.murrayfieldcurling.co.uk

ANNUAL GENERAL MEETING OF EDINBURGH CURLING CLUB LIMITED held at 7.00 pm on Thursday 2 September 2021

1 Welcome

John Hogarth President of Edinburgh Curling Club welcomed everyone to the meeting, and was delighted that we were able to have a face to face AGM. He asked that all members mute their mobile phones.

He then asked that the members pay their respects for a short silence for the members who had died in the past year. They are :-

Doreen Elder Pentland Ladies

David Edwards Corstorphine

Anne Gumley Gogar Park

Marjorie Liston Edinburgh Ladies

Mike Monaghan Merchiston

Andrew Mather Brunstfield Links

Jim Paterson Watsonians

Helen Ritchie Edinburgh Ladies

Kenneth Skinner Murrayfield Golf Club

James Taylor Musselburgh

Ros Trail Colinton Ladies

Alan Williamson Bruntsfield Links

Isobel Blair Eddleston

Bruce Blyth Eddelston

Alan Stewart Eddleston

Alison Stewart Eddelston

David Hall Corstorphine

Evan Lloyd Corstorphine

Alistair Rae Abbotsford

Louise Dick Abbotsford

John Mauritzen Boswall

If there are any names missing from the above list please email our secretary and the list will be amended.

2 Notice of Meeting

Notice of the AGM was advertised on the website on the 12 July 2021 and reconfirmed on the 03 August 2021. It was emailed to all ECC members together with tonight's agenda on 05 August 2021.

Apologies where received from

Pat Edington Vicky Gumley Graeme Coulthard Stewart Cobb Dan Lean Norman Nicol

Colin Baxter Elizabeth Sharp Isobel Bridie Gillean Hoehnke Jon Addinall Kath Murray

Robin Copland Ian Dick Ian Keron

3 Minutes of the Annual General Meeting held on 10th Sept 2020

A copy of the minutes has been available on the website since 03 August 2021 and emailed to members on the 5 August. The minutes were approved by John Hogarth and seconded by Bill Manson.

4 Matters arising from the Minutes

There are no matters arising from last year's minutes.

5 Chairman's Report

John Hogarth presented the following report. Well what a year since our last AGM. We opened for the 2020/21 season on Sunday 27 September 2020 however following a Scottish Government announcement MCL had to suspend all curling on Friday 9 October. As everyone knows the COVID virus pandemic continued and following the relevant Scottish Government guidelines, the Boards of Murrayfield Curling Limited (MCL) and Edinburgh Curling Club (ECC) met to review the implications of the situation. This ultimately led to the sad decision to suspend curling at Murrayfield for the rest of the 20/21 season. On behalf of the ECC board I would like to thank all members and clubs who donated their ice fees or made donations towards the new club room development Your support is hugely appreciated.

Although there was virtually no curling played last season, both boards have been exceptionally busy working behind the scenes, applying for a host of financial support packages like furlough payments, rates relief, Sportscotland grant to mention but a few. We had a considerable number of Zoom meet-

ings over the closed period and I hope all members enjoyed the regular communications that we issued to try and ensure that you were kept fully informed. I would also thank everyone who completed our survey.

On the 21 December 2020 ECC received an email from Murrayfield Ice Rink together with a letter from their solicitor announcing the termination of this lounge by 31 December 2022. The email read "These are very difficult times for all Ice Rinks and the Covid-19 pandemic has resulted in the Murrayfield Ice Rink Board reviewing all of our current and potential future income streams. As a result of the review we have issued instructions to our Solicitors to formally notify Edinburgh Curling Club Ltd that the lease to the Curling Bar is to terminate on 31 December 2022." As you will know we had planned to commence the New Clubroom Development over the summer of 2020 however due to the COVID pandemic ECC had to postpone this project. As you will see on tonight's agenda item 8 is the Club Room Update where further information will be provided and I will leave this topic until that point. In addition only yesterday I was informed that the rugby team, Murrayfield Wanderers who have been using next door's Riversdale Suite bar, however MIR have opted not to renew their lease.

Thank goodness for our wonderful NHS and the fantastic vaccine campaign which I trust will make all of us safer and minimise risk as we look forward to the new season. On a very positive note, we will open on Monday 27 September 2021. However, we will be providing free practice ice on Saturday 25 & Sunday 26 September for those who wish to reacquaint themselves with the enjoyment of curling before the serious business of club curling commences. In addition we have now scheduled a friendly bonspiel/celebration on Saturday 25 September with Jen & Bruce being our invited guests. This season, we are obviously hoping for a return to our normal curling programme and numbers, but we are aware that some clubs have reported that their member numbers are down. We thank you for your support going forward and would ask that you encourage all of your club members to return and enjoy our wonderful game of curling and indeed encourage any family and friends who may wish to join us, to do so. They will be warmly welcomed.

I started my report with "what a year" and "what a year" it was for Bruce Mouat and Jennifer Dodds. Congratulations to Jennifer and Bruce who won Gold for Scotland in the World Mixed Doubles Championships at Curl Aberdeen. Their success ensured Team GB will be in the 2022 Winter Olympic Mixed Doubles curling competition. I hope that these two ECC members will be given the opportunity to represent GB in Beijing. This was Bruce's fourth final after competing in the Canadian curling bubble, as Calgary hosted the World Men's Curling Championship where Bruce and his team won the Silver Medals, followed by winning the Grand Slam of Curling Champions Cup and the Grand Slam of Curling Players Championship. By skipping his Scotland Men's team to Silver against Sweden, Bruce also qualified Team GB for the 2022 Winter Olympic Men's curling competition. Bruce and Jen, we wish both of you every success in the coming year. You will see a super picture of Jen and Bruce now displayed in the lounge and I would like to thank one of our members who very generously paid for the photograph and framings costs. Finally there are still a number of spaces on Saturday 25 September at 4.00pm when we will celebrate on the ice with Jen & Bruce followed by some supper. If you have not already applied please speak to Margaret after tonight's meeting or email her .

I would like to congratulate Susan Kelsey on being appointed as the first lady President of the RCCC at this year's Scottish Curling AGM.

I am pleased to report that John Stewart from Oxenfoord received his RCCC 50 year medal this year - well done to John on this amazing achievement.

As you know Scott Henderson retired this year and we wish him a very happy and well deserved retirement. Aaron Forsyth is the new ice rink Manager and we wish him every success in his new role, ably supported by Stuart, Fraser, Andy and Kirsty.

Laurna Nicolson resigned from ECC over the summer, as she was offered a new job at Kingsknowe Golf Club. We will miss her cheery chat, but wish her every success in her new role.

I am delighted that Paul Thomson and his team will be providing their usual excellent catering service this season. Please do all you can to support them.

In addition I thank Lindsay Scotland, David Andrew, Andy MacPherson, Sean Murphy and Mike Wood who are all members of the ECC Competitions Sub Group. Your ideas and support are appreciated. While mentioning the ECC competitions, I would urge you to support these competitions as we have several opportunities for you to participate. Full details are available on our website or speak to Andy in the office.

I would also like to thank Norman Watt and the MCL Board for inviting, for the first time the ECC President to be an observer on their board. This initiative helps to enhance the ECC/MCL partnership and ensure the continued success of curling at Murrayfield.

To all ECC Board members. This is my last AGM report as your President and I thank each and everyone of you for all of your support and contributions over the past two years. In particular to Alasdair, Margaret and Sean, as we have been engaged in many, many discussions, Zoom meetings, phone calls, debates over the last few months. Finally to Frank Ross and Colin Baxter who tonight retire from the ECC Board, your contributions have been excellent and Frank, I'm sure you will still get a number of requests from the new board. Frank has organised a Civic Reception for Jen and Bruce at the city chambers so you can look forward to seeing the photographs at a later date.

Finally my thanks to all members for their continued support. Please continue to support this wonderful club, let's hope we achieve a trouble free, no lockdowns and a successful season. Enjoy the social side of curling by using the catering and bar offerings and I look forward to seeing everyone back on the ice.

6 Report from Murrayfield Curling Limited

Norman Watt Chair of MCL presented the following

As Chair of Murrayfield Curling Ltd it is my pleasure to present this report on our activities since your last AGM.

In September last year we at MCL were full of hope and expectation for the new season, despite the curtailment of the previous one. Because we had spent the summer introducing many new controls and precautions to prevent the spread of Covid, we were looking forward to the new curling season, albeit with new protocols. We started the season on schedule after a tremendous effort by Scott and his team.

However, we all know what happened next. We took the decision to suspend curling from close of play on Friday 9th October and after awaiting the outcome of various reviews and deadlines we made the inevitable decision to switch off the plant on the 29th October 2020 with the hope that we could start up again in January this year. However, that was not to be and the outcome was that we along with all curling ice rinks in Scotland lost a full season's trading apart from the first three weeks.

After the decision to close was made, the imperative for the business was to minimise cash burn. This resulted in many and on occasion very long virtual : meetings of MCL and ECC board members to manage all the aspects that flowed from this including applying for both UK government and local authority support and monitoring all aspects of our cash flow.

After dealing with the consequences of melting the ice pad, Scott's team were furloughed. Kirsty worked from home on a reduced basis under the furlough scheme dealing with the administrative effects of the closure including the rebating of unused ice fees and the accounting for member donations.

I wish to record through your minutes, MCL's gratitude for the financial and verbal support given by Clubs and individual members.

Both the ECC and MCL board members, spent long hours individually and collectively compiling a joint application under the Scottish Ice Rink Support Scheme for which we were ultimately successful in receiving £154,000.

The receipt by ECC of the termination of the Curling Bar Lease on 21st December 2020 sparked increased activity with relation to our plans for the extension of the balcony to provide club rooms. More of that later under item 8 of your agenda.

At previous AGMs when it came to the point of informing you of our financial performance, because our year end was 31st July, I was only able to give you headline figures as our accounts had not been completed.

However, MCL has changed its year end date to synchronise its reporting on the same date as ECC. This allows us to present to you a more complete picture and I would ask you to refer to the accounts contained within the notice of this AGM, in particular the Director's report which gives a detailed analysis of the main elements.

I do not intend to go through the accounts but will take questions, if your President allows time for that at the end of my report.

Earlier I briefly mentioned Scott Henderson. As you will all know Scott has decided to retire. On behalf of the MCL Board I wish to record our thanks and gratitude for Scott's efforts and loyalty to this curling rink. He has been central to the implementation of all the improvements over recent years. I wish him well in his retirement. To that end, we intend to mark his retirement with a presentation to him on the 25th September after the opening bonspiel and I would encourage you to book your place for that.

We are pleased that Aaron has taken on the mantle of Scott's successor and wish him well for the future.

Thanks to the efforts of the world's scientific community and our NHS, we in this country are in a better position this September than we were last. Our plans are well advanced to commence club curling on 27th September and are encouraged by the level of ice take up. We are cautiously optimistic about the new season.

I wish to record MCL's thanks for the sterling efforts, in challenging circumstances, of Kirsty, Aaron, Frazer, Stuart and Andy. It has been some year for them.

I wish to thank my fellow board members, Jenny Barr, Mike Wood, Paul Stevenson and Stewart Cobb for their support of me but more importantly for their tireless effort in ensuring the future of curling at Murrayfield and all that it entails.

Finally, I wish to thank you John, as you demit your position as President, for your significant contribution and co-operation to and with the MCL Board. This ends my report and if you wish I will take questions on the accounts.

7 Presentation of Accounts

Alasdair Seftor Treasurer presented the accounts.

Welcome to my report for the year ending 30th April 2021. This report will be shorter than normal, but I will happily answer any questions. For those who have brought the accounts along please turn to the 2nd last page.

The trading income of the company was £26,843, this is made up nearly entirely of membership income. There was a reduction of around 300 members (20%) last year with some clubs not paying any memberships!

The wages and salaries of £9414 were covered in part by the furlough payment below but we did make some payments out with the scheme.

The Bar costs of £3,682 was for the stock that was written off during the season

Shop costs of £10,349 was for stock that will hopefully be sold during this season

Other Operating income includes –

£28,325 – Grants from UK/SG grants

£7,050 – Furlough payments

£8,000 – Part of the Sportscotland grant. £10,000 sits as a creditor as there are conditions against this portion

£28,671 – Donations from the first fundraising campaign. This will now tail off this year

£97,069 – Donations from the 2nd half ice fees

Admin Expenses

Property repairs – include a till system upgrade to allow the facility to become cashless. It also includes the H & S audit that was in the line below last year

Development costs include Engineers & Architects costs costs and design fees

Accountancy fees of £5.6k remained high due to added work required for submission to Sportscotland

Irrecoverable VAT was higher at £9456 due to reduction in chargeable income for our partial exemption calculation. We are looking at a claim c£3k through a temporary amendment to the vat recovery rate.

We have made a gain of £5,344 on our WCF loan that is in dollars

Overall, we made a profit of £99,148 but this is clearly underpinned by the generosity of our members and the government support.

One last point - For next year we have decided to franchise the bar along with the catering to Parsley & Thyme. We will be paid a percentage of the combined turnover.

Alasdair proposed the accounts and this was seconded by John Hogarth.

8. Club Room Update

Norman Watt introduced by explaining that there have been some changes to the project in that MCL have been exploring their VAT status and that this will be covered by Alasdair later in the presentation. The building project has had a fire exit added to it and Paul will cover this in his presentation. He then went on to explain the relationship with Murrayfield Ice Rink (MIR) and the burden on the property which was put in place in 2006. This requires that any structural work has to have a license for works to be agreed by MIR but that they cannot unreasonably withhold consent. MCL have been in negotiation with MIR and their lawyers about this since the building warrant was approved in March. This is a significant period of time and MCL are pressing to have this resolved.

MCL have recently received communication from MIR lawyers raising questions about another aspect of the burden of the property which is about the ancillary services provided by MCL. They are questioning whether a bar and catering facilities are appropriate ancillary services for curling. Norman indicated that in the event that negotiations with MIR become difficult that we might need to consider legal action down the line.

Paul Stevenson then provided a property update.

Consents

A Building Warrant has been secured for the structural changes (March 2021) and another building warrant will be required for the kitchen fit-out but this requires no structural changes.

We have been in communication with MIR for over a year. The approved warrant was issued to MIR in March 2021 but consent is still awaited.

Space Planning

Space Solutions advice was sought in April 2020. The existing layout has 96 covers in bar area.

In the proposed layout there will be 84-104 covers depending on seating.

Contractor Update

A Tender was conducted during December 2019 and John Denis was the preferred contractor and was ready to commence April 2020. This was put on hold due to COVID

John Denis still remains interested, but the project will be re-tendered with them (at least). The Re-tender for the project will go out December 2021 for an April 2022 start

Doig + Smith (May 21) estimated that for an April 2022 start the potential cost is £510k ex VAT. The increase from the previous tender cost is due to the following:-

Kitchen / Bar £42k (this was going to be fitted out at later date but now needs to be part of overall tender)

AHU / Steel / Stair (increased costs of materials)

Enhanced Fire Protection (MIR were questioning our right to use an existing fire exit into their premises, however by including a new fire exit within the clubrooms this brings everything under our control)

Larger scope to plans

Inflation / contingency

Alasdair Seftor then presented the financial status of the clubroom development

There are 3 main factors that need to be considered when working out if we have sufficient funds to complete the development project

Build costs –

VAT – The VAT on this project is likely to be in the region of £100,000. ECC are VAT registered and can claim 65% VAT back. MCL are not currently VAT registered. Both companies have sought expert VAT advice. Very recent advice suggests MCL could become VAT registered and using the capital goods scheme could claim 100% Vat back. In order to do this, the bar and catering would need to pass to MCL so they have claimable VAT services. The final decision about this has not yet been taken.

Cash Reserves – Will the companies make a profit or loss? This depends on ice bookings and membership fees, Covid interruptions. We do have members who have offered to loan us £250,000 but we need to be sure that we will have the ongoing funds to repay these loans. This is all uncertain and we might not be in a position to be clearer about this until the New Year.

At this point questions were asked for.

Ruth Addinall (SAIE) asked if the costs are likely to be £520,000 before VAT.

Alistair Seftor confirmed that is the case.

David Miller (Merchiston) asked what is the reason for MIR opposing the development

Norman W responded that it was wrong to say that MIR at this stage were opposing the development but in relation to the burden on the property they were questioning aspects of it. He explained there are two parts to the burden. One is any structural changes common to both properties, requires MIR's permission but that this cannot be not unreasonably withheld. Paul Stevenson added that MCL sought MIR's permission in March and have not got agreement yet despite much correspondence. It is expected that we will get this as it is fairly straight forward. The length of time and the extent of the correspondence might be perceived as unreasonable and protracted.

MIR lawyers recently wrote to MCL reminding them of the other part of the burden which relates to their rights to operate a curling rink and ancillary services linked to curling. Ancillary services not related to curling requires their permission. They raised the question of whether a bar and catering facilities are an appropriate ancillary service for curling. Norman speculated that this might be part of commercial negotiations but that there might be myriad of reasons. Paul added that we were approached by a film company during the summer and MCL agreed to rent out the ice hall to them in order to provide additional income. MCL then received correspondence from MIR reminding them that under the burden they should have sought their permission to so this.

David Fell (Bank of Scotland) pointed out that the building is only used for sporting activities with associated bar and catering and that nothing has changed. Paul Stevenson answered that it is clear what is in the MCL title. The bar and catering facilities are part of curling culture and the link between the two is strong. This is similar to other ice rinks and MCL will vigorously defend the position that bar and catering are part of our business.

Kim Dalland (Corstorphine Ladies) asked if there is a hold on the appeal to clubs to donate any money.

Alasdair Seftor replied that we are not actively campaigning for funds but if any clubs that have surplus funds and wish to donate, then we are happy to receive donations. We will be reaching out to clubs once the figures are more certain.

Graeme Maguire (Haddington) stated that while he appreciated the uncertainty regarding costs, were there ballpark figures he could report back to his club.

Alasdair Seftor and Mike Wood outlined the following

Projected costs £ 510,000 plus vat

Loans from members £250,000 loans

ECC reserves, assuming a breakeven year £130,00

MCL Reserves are £236,000 (but some of this is needed for summer costs, plus we are not allowed to use funds from Sports Scotland grant for a capital project and they might want to claw back some of the furlough payments. There are also two outstanding loans and a bounce back loan which needs to be serviced. So, there is less certainty about the exact sum of the MCL contribution.

However, Mike indicated that part of the solution for MCL to have more funds is for our members to curl often. Ice bookings for the coming season income are similar to the last uninterrupted season so this is a good position. Extra curling is found money. So, Mike encouraged members to curl more.

Ian Donald (East Linton) asked if we could publish plans for the development with the changes so members can see what their money is going to be used for.

John Hogarth indicated that they will be made available at the beginning of the season for members to see.

Ian also questioned the layout of the clubrooms re space. Paul Stevenson replied that we had used a space planning company and that their report indicated a seating layout of 80-110 covers. It was agreed both sets of plans will be displayed for the beginning of the season for members to view.

9 Election of Office Bearers and Director

John Hogarth President of ECC to nominated Sean Murphy as President and this was seconded by Paul Davis. John indicated that he would be an excellent president and wished him all the best. The members accepted this nomination. John presented Sean with the President's badge. Sean presented John with his Past President's badge.

Sean thanked John for his two years as president completed under difficult circumstances. He has done much great work and two things stand out. His work on ECC competitions setting up a competitions committee and putting competitions on a steady footing. The other is the strong relationship he has established with MCL with both boards working together in partnership.

Sean said it was a pleasure and a privilege to join the illustrious group of presidents of ECC. He looked forward to moving out of the shadow of covid and enjoying the camaraderie and being back on the ice curling. He looked forward to working with the ECC board and MCL and the wider membership.

The new President then indicated that he wished to nominate Ian Keron Mid Calder as vice president this was seconded by Scott Baird. Unfortunately Ian is not able to be with us this evening as he had a preplanned holiday arranged. Ian is well known to everyone Oatridge is his mother club and he is a member of Midcalder and is a past President of Gogar Park and West Lothian Province. He has been on the RCCC club development committee and is level 2 coach. He could be considered as Mr Curling as he is at the rink so often. The members accepted this nomination.

Sean indicated that Margaret Nicol as secretary and Alasdair Seftor as treasurer were eligible for re election and were willing to stand. This was nominated by Sean Murphy and was seconded by Edith Butler. The members accepted these nominations.

Sean indicated that Frank Ross's term of office was completed and he wished to thank him for all his work on the board. His insight from the City of Edinburgh council was invaluable Having the Lord Provost on the board was extremely useful.

Colin Baxter's term as Past President was also completed and he wanted to thank Colin for the wealth of curling knowledge and experience he brought to the board.

Sean nominated Keith Wilson as a director and this was seconded by Paul Davis. Keith has been a lawyer for over 30 years and came back to Scotland in 2014. He has now retired and will work as a consultant. He is a member of both Gogar Park and Carrington. The members accepted this nomination.

10 Appointment of Auditors

Alasdair proposed that Johnston Smillie chartered accountants be re-appointed as auditors. The proposal was seconded by Margaret Nicol.

In the absence of other nominations, Johnston Smillie chartered accountants are duly re-appointed.

11 Any Other Competent Business Sean indicated that ECC had one item of competent business and that he wished to nominate Jennifer Dodds for honorary membership. Jennifer has been a member of ECC since 2004. Her mother club is Carrington. She has made multiple appearances at world Juniors, Europeans and Women's Worlds. She is part of the podium elite squad of British Curling. In Aberdeen this year she along with Bruce Mouat became the World Mixed Doubles Champions which is a first for Scotland and we wanted to honour that achievement. The members unanimously endorsed this honorary membership.

Sean thanked everyone for their attendance and looked forward to seeing everyone back on the ice at Murrayfield. The meeting closed at 20.10.

Trevor Dodds proposed a vote of thanks to both boards for all their work.

